

# Appendix

## Citations and Research Support

**Principle 1: All students deserve the opportunity to develop their character, talents and interests, while receiving support to address individual learning needs.**

1. *How People Learn: Brain, Mind, Experience, and School: Expanded Edition*. National Research Council. 1999. <https://nap.nationalacademies.org/catalog/9853/how-people-learn-brain-mind-experience-and-school-expanded-edition>.
2. *The Evidence Base for How We Learn: Supporting Students' Social, Emotional, and Academic Development*. 2017. The Aspen Institute. September 14, 2017. <https://www.aspeninstitute.org/publications/evidence-base-learn/>.
3. *How the Science of Learning and Development Can Transform Education*; Pamela Cantor, Linda Darling-Hammond, Bethany Little, Scott Palmer, David Osher, Karen Pittman, and Todd Rose, Science of Learning and Development Alliance, (Updated May 2022); [SoLD-Science-Translation\\_May-2020\\_FNL.pdf](#) ([soldalliance.org](http://soldalliance.org)).
4. Osher, David, Pamela Cantor, Juliette Berg, Lily Steyer, and Todd Rose. "Drivers of Human Development: How Relationships and Context Shape Learning and Development1." *Applied Developmental Science* 24, no. 1 (2018): 6-36. <https://doi.org/10.1080/10888691.2017.1398650>.
5. *Extracurricular Participation and Achievement*, National Center for Education Statistics, Institute for Education Sciences, U.S. Department of Education, (1995) <https://nces.ed.gov/pubs95/web/95741.asp> (extracurricular participation associated with better attendance, engagement, and achievement).

## Principle 2: All students deserve opportunities that prepare them to succeed in the future of work.

6. Harvard Economics Professor David Demming finds that job growth and wage growth are concentrated in jobs that demand interpersonal skills in addition to technical knowledge; Shafer, Leah. *Interpersonal Skills and Today's Job Market*. Harvard Graduate School of Education, October 3, 2017. <https://www.gse.harvard.edu/news/uk/17/10/interpersonal-skills-and-todays-job-market>.
7. Dondi, Marco, Julia Klier, Frédéric Panier, and Jörg Schubert. *Defining the Skills Citizens Will Need in the Future World of Work*. McKinsey & Company, August 31, 2022. <https://www.mckinsey.com/industries/public-and-social-sector/our-insights/defining-the-skills-citizens-will-need-in-the-future-world-of-work>.
8. *New Foundational Skills*. Emsi Burning Glass, March 13, 2019. <https://www.economicmodeling.com/2019/03/13/new-foundational-skills/>.
9. *Credentials Matter*, Burning Glass Institute and ExcelinEd: May 2019. <https://excelined.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/05ExcelinEdBurningGlassTechnologies.CredentialsMatterNationalLandscapeofHighSchoolCredentialAttainmentComparedtoWorkforceDemand.May2019.pdf>.
10. *The High Demand for Durable Skills, America Succeeds, 2021*. <https://americasucceeds.org/portfolio/the-high-demand-for-durable-skills-october-2021>.

## Principle 3: All students deserve opportunities that prepare them to fully participate in American democracy.

11. "Seven in Ten Americans Say the Country Is in Crisis, at Risk of Failing" NPR/Ipsos Poll, January 2, 2022. <https://www.ipsos.com/en-us/seven-ten-americans-say-country-crisis-risk-failing>.
12. "High School Students Are Unequipped to Spot 'Fake News.'" *Stanford News*. Stanford Graduate School of Education, November 18, 2019. <https://news.stanford.edu/2019/11/18/high-school-students-unequipped-spot-fake-news/>.
13. *Educating for American Democracy: Excellence in History and Civics for All Learners*. iCivics, 2021, [Educating-for-American-Democracy-Report-Excellence-in-History-and-Civics-for-All-Learners.pdf](#).
14. Jeremy A. Stern et al., *State of State Standards for Civics and U.S. History in 2021*. Washington D.C.: Thomas B. Fordham Institute, June 2021. <https://fordhaminstitute.org/national/research/state-state-standards-civics-and-us-history-2021>.

## Principle 4: All students deserve safe and healthy environments that are conducive to academic learning.

15. Jackson, C.K., Porter, S.C., Easton, J.Q., Blanchard, A., and Kiguel, S. (2021). *Linking Social-Emotional Learning to Long-Term Success: Student survey responses show effects in high school and beyond*. *Education Next*, 21(1), 64-71, [https://www.educationnext.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/01/ednext\\_XXI\\_1\\_jackson\\_et\\_al.pdf](https://www.educationnext.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/01/ednext_XXI_1_jackson_et_al.pdf).
16. *Creating Conditions for Student Success: A Policymakers' School Climate Playbook*. The Aspen Institute Education and Society Program and ExcelinEd, January 2021. <https://www.aspeninstitute.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/01/Aspen-Institute-School-Climate-Playbook-Final.pdf>.
17. One-third of American 15-year olds report they don't experience belonging at their school: OECD (2020), "Sense of belonging at school", in *PISA 2018 Results (Volume III): What School Life Means for Students' Lives*, OECD Publishing, Paris, <https://doi.org/10.1787/d69dc209-en>.
18. One in five American public school students reports being bullied in school: Assistant Secretary for Public Affairs (ASPA). *Facts About Bullying*. [StopBullying.gov](https://www.stopbullying.gov), September 9, 2021. <https://www.stopbullying.gov/resources/facts>.
19. "Developing students with strong character who are connected to their peers, educators, and communities in meaningful ways can improve school climate and prevent violence from occurring. Research suggests that a positive school climate can lead to a significant decrease in the likelihood of crime, aggression, and violent behavior." *School Climate: A Positive School Climate Can Prevent Violence*. SchoolSafety.gov, 2016, <https://www.schoolsafety.gov/school-climate>.
20. Prothero, Arianna, and Maya Riser-Kositsky. "School Counselors and Psychologists Remain Scarce Even as Needs Rise." *Education Week*, June 1, 2022, <https://www.edweek.org/leadership/school-counselors-and-psychologists-remain-scarce-even-as-needs-rise/2022/03>.
21. Vestal, Christine. *Covid Harmed Kids' Mental Health-and Schools Are Feeling It*. The Pew Charitable Trusts, November 9, 2021, <https://www.pewtrusts.org/en/research-and-analysis/blogs/stateline/2021/11/08/covid-harmed-kids-mental-health-and-schools-are-feeling-it>.

22. Exposure to heat in schools lower achievement, yet approximately 42% of public school classrooms in the United States lack any or adequate air conditioning, disproportionately disadvantaging low-income students and students of color: Sparks, Sarah, *As Temperatures Climb, Test Scores Drop in Schools Without Air Conditioning*, *Education Week*, May 31, 2018, <https://www.edweek.org/leadership/as-the-temperature-climbs-test-scores-drop-in-schools-without-air-conditioning/2018/05>.
23. "Air filter installation is a highly cost-effective policy to raise student achievement and, given that underprivileged students attend schools in highly polluted areas, one that can reduce the pervasive test score gaps that plague public education." Gilraine, Michael. *Air Filters, Pollution and Student Achievement*. EdWorkingPapers. March 2020, <https://www.edworkingpapers.com/ai20-188>.
24. Barnum, Matt, *As Biden Eyes Infrastructure, Recent Research Suggests Students' Environment Affects Academic Success*, Chalkbeat, April 14, 2021, <https://www.chalkbeat.org/2021/4/14/22384257/biden-schools-infrastructure-research-environment>.
25. Research suggests that rural schools in Texas educating low-income students have worse facilities than other schools and that this decreased student learning outcomes: Sheets, Martin Eugene. "The Relationship between the Condition of School Facilities and Certain Educational Outcomes, Particularly in Rural Public High Schools in Texas." *TTU DSpace Home*. Texas Tech University, May 1, 2009, <https://ttu-ir.tdl.org/handle/2346/20199>.

## **Principle 5: All students deserve access to caring adults with expertise in creating quality learning environments and experiences.**

26. Researchers estimate that teachers make two-to-three times more impact on student learning outcomes than any other school-based opportunity or resources: Oppen, Isaac M., *Teachers Matter: Understanding Teachers' Impact on Student Achievement*. Santa Monica, CA: RAND Corporation, 2019. [https://www.rand.org/pubs/research\\_reports/RR4312.html](https://www.rand.org/pubs/research_reports/RR4312.html).
27. Teacher impacts are very durable: economist Raj Chetty and colleagues estimate that individual teachers significantly influence students' income in adulthood. Chetty, Raj, et al. *How Does Your Kindergarten Classroom Affect Your Earnings? Evidence from Project Star*, Opportunity Insights, March 2011. [http://www.equality-of-opportunity.org/assets/documents/star\\_paper.pdf](http://www.equality-of-opportunity.org/assets/documents/star_paper.pdf).

28. Precipitous drops in candidates completing educator preparation programs, covered by Education Week: Will, Madeline. "Fewer People Are Getting Teacher Degrees. Prep Programs Sound the Alarm." *Education Week*, March 29, 2022. <https://www.edweek.org/teaching-learning/fewer-people-are-getting-teacher-degrees-prep-programs-sound-the-alarm/2022/03>.
29. Grissom, Jason A., Anna J. Egalite, and Constance A. Lindsay. *How Principals Affect Students and Schools: A Systematic Synthesis of Two Decades of Research*. Wallace Foundation, February 2021, <https://www.wallacefoundation.org/knowledge-center/pages/how-principals-affect-students-and-schools-a-systematic-synthesis-of-two-decades-of-research.aspx>.
30. Allensworth, E.M., & Hart, H. *How do principals influence student achievement?* Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Consortium on School Research. March 2018, <https://consortium.uchicago.edu/sites/default/files/2018-10/Leadership%20Snapshot-Mar2018-Consortium.pdf>.
31. Leana, Carrie R. "The Missing Link in School Reform (SSIR)." *Stanford Social Innovation Review*, 2011. [https://ssir.org/articles/entry/the\\_missing\\_link\\_in\\_school\\_reform](https://ssir.org/articles/entry/the_missing_link_in_school_reform).
32. Most states do not assess whether teachers are familiar with the science of teaching reading, according to the National Council on Teacher Quality: Putman, H. & Walsh, K. *State of the States 2021: Teacher Preparation Policy*. Washington, D.C.: National Council on Teacher Quality, 2021, <https://www.nctq.org/publications/State-of-the-States-2021:-Teacher-Preparation-Policy#reading>.
33. Schwartz, Sarah. "Most States Fail to Measure Teachers' Knowledge of the 'Science of Reading,' Report Says." *Education Week*, May 4, 2021. <https://www.edweek.org/teaching-learning/most-states-fail-to-measure-teachers-knowledge-of-the-science-of-reading-report-says/2021/03>.
34. Education research is not made accessible to teachers in ways that are accessible or easy to use: Willingham, Daniel T. "Making Education Research Relevant." *Education Next*, January 10, 2022, <https://www.educationnext.org/making-education-research-relevant-how-researchers-can-give-teachers-more-choices/>.
35. The U.S. Department of Education Institute for Education Sciences heard from teachers that many are unfamiliar with sources of education research that could improve practice: Sparks, Sarah D. "Teachers Want Education Research. the Feds Spend Millions on It. so Why Can't It Get to the Classroom?" *Education Week*, February 28, 2022, <https://www.edweek.org/leadership/teachers-want-education-research-the-feds-spend-millions-on-it-so-why-cant-it-get-to-the-classroom/2018/11>.

36. The Brookings Institute summarized the research on teacher diversity and student success this way: “if a black male student has at least one black teacher in the third, fourth, or fifth grade, he is significantly less likely to drop out of high school and more likely to aspire to attend a four-year college (as proxied by taking a college entrance exam). They find that these effects are especially pronounced for economically disadvantaged black male students. For instance, they find that a disadvantaged black male’s exposure to at least one black teacher in elementary school reduces his probability of dropping out of high school by nearly 40 percent,” Figlio, David. *The Importance of a Diverse Teaching Force*. Brookings Institute, March 9, 2022. <https://www.brookings.edu/research/the-importance-of-a-diverse-teaching-force/>

37. *It Matters Now More Than Ever: What New Developments Say About Teacher Diversity and Student Success*, Brookings Institute (2022), citing recent research showing that Hispanic students similarly benefit when instructed by Hispanic educators, and that all students benefit from a diverse teaching force. Hansen, Michael, Constance A. Lindsay, and Seth Gershenson. *It Matters Now More than Ever: What New Developments Say about Teacher Diversity and Student Success*. Brookings Institute, August 2, 2022. <https://www.brookings.edu/blog/brown-center-chalkboard/2022/08/01/it-matters-now-more-than-ever-what-new-developments-say-about-teacher-diversity-and-student-success/>.

38. NewSchools collection of multiple studies on this topic: *Impact of Same-Race Teacher Match on Student Outcomes*. New Schools, 2020, <https://www.newschools.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/03/The-Impact-of-Teacher-Diversity-in-Education.pdf>.

## **Principle 6: All students deserve instruction and tasks that are worthy of their effort, aligned to state standards, and relevant to the skills they will need to succeed in life.**

39. Santelises, Sonja Brookins. *Checking in: Do Classroom Assignments Reflect Today’s Higher Standards?* The Education Trust, July 16, 2021. <https://edtrust.org/resource/classroomassignments/>.

40. *The Opportunity Myth*. TNTP, 2018. <https://tntp.org/publications/view/student-experiences/the-opportunity-myth>.

41. The Gallup organization has documented for years that student engagement declines through middle and high school and that by 12th grade most students are not actively engaged with school: Calderon, Valerie and Yu, Daniela, *Student Enthusiasm Falls as High School Graduation Nears*, Gallup, 2017, <https://news.gallup.com/opinion/gallup/211631/student-enthusiasm-falls-high-school-graduation-nears.aspx>.

42. Barshay, Jill. "Proof Points: Four New Studies Bolster the Case for Project-Based Learning." *The Hechinger Report*, March 8, 2021, <https://hechingerreport.org/proof-points-four-new-studies-bolster-the-case-for-project-based-learning/>.
43. Terada, Youki. "New Research Makes a Powerful Case for PBL." *Edutopia*. George Lucas Educational Foundation, February 21, 2021, <https://www.edutopia.org/article/new-research-makes-powerful-case-pbl>.
44. For a compendium of high-quality student tasks and exemplars of student work-product, consult: *Models of Excellence: The Center for High-Quality Student Work*, EL Education and the Harvard Graduate School of Education, <https://modelsofexcellence.eleducation.org>.

## **Principle 7: States are responsible for essential policy context and enabling conditions regarding students' opportunities to learn.**

45. Parker, Emily. *50-State Review: Constitutional Obligations for Public Education*, Education Commission of the States, March 2016, <https://www.ecs.org/wp-content/uploads/2016-Constitutional-obligations-for-public-education-1.pdf>.
46. Evans, Alyssa, et. al., *50-State Comparison: K-12 Governance*, Education Commission of the States. November, 2020, <https://www.ecs.org/50-state-comparison-k-12-governance/>.
47. Junge, Melissa, and Sheara Krvaric. *A Guide to State Educational Agency Oversight Responsibilities Under ESSA: The Role of the State in the Local Implementation of ESSA Programs*. Council of Chief State School Officers, May 2017, [https://ccsso.org/sites/default/files/2017-10/CCSSO\\_State\\_Authority\\_Over\\_ESSA\\_Programs.pdf](https://ccsso.org/sites/default/files/2017-10/CCSSO_State_Authority_Over_ESSA_Programs.pdf).

## **Principle 8: Schools and public education systems need partnerships with other public agencies and service providers to adequately understand and address students' needs, opportunities, and outcomes.**

48. Davis, Jennifer. *Wise Investments in the Future: Cross-Sector Collaborations and Student Success Plans to Improve Child Well-Being and School Success*. The Education Redesign Lab and Aspen Institute Education and Society Program, September 2021, [https://edredesign.org/files/edredesign/files/american\\_rescue\\_plan-investments\\_in\\_collaboration\\_and\\_success\\_planning.pdf?m=1629226845](https://edredesign.org/files/edredesign/files/american_rescue_plan-investments_in_collaboration_and_success_planning.pdf?m=1629226845).
49. Over 1.2 million students experienced homelessness in the 2019-20 school year, approximately 2.5% of all public school students: *Student Homelessness in America*. National Center for Homeless Education, 2021. <https://nche.ed.gov/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/Student-Homelessness-in-America-2021.pdf>.



50. In 2019, 12.5 million students lived in poverty, representing about 25% of all public school students and many of these students experienced food insecurity: *Child Hunger in America*. No Kid Hungry. <https://www.nokidhungry.org/who-we-are/hunger-facts>.
51. "Map: School Medicaid Programs." *Healthy Students, Promising Futures*, July 25, 2022, <https://healthystudentspromisingfutures.org/map-school-medicaid-programs/>.
52. *State Medicaid & Education Standards for School Health Personnel*. Healthy Schools Campaign, October 2021, <https://www.healthystudentspromisingfutures.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/11/State-Medicaid-Education-Standards-for-School-Health-Personnel.pdf>.
53. *Community School Resources*. Learning Policy Institute. Accessed September 6, 2022, <https://learningpolicyinstitute.org/project/community-schools>.
54. *Strong and Sustainable Children's Cabinets*. The Aspen Institute Education and Society Program & the Forum for Youth Investment, 2021, <https://www.aspen-institute.org/wp-content/uploads/2022/03/childrens-cabinets-report-030122.pdf>.
55. *How Governors and Mayors Can Support Schools so Schools Can Support Students*. Aspen Institute Education & Society Program, October 7, 2020, <https://www.aspeninstitute.org/publications/how-governors-and-mayors-can-support-schools-so-schools-can-support-students/>.

## **Principle 9: States must strategically collect and use data to illuminate the extent to which schools are providing the opportunities students need to learn.**

56. *Using State Data Systems to Create an Information Culture in Education*, Education Commission of the States, April 2019, <https://www.ecs.org/wp-content/uploads/Using-State-Data-Systems-to-Create-an-Information-Culture-in-Education.pdf>.
57. *Using Opportunity to Learn Data to Support Educational Equity*, Scott Marion, Center for Assessment, October 2020, [https://www.nciea.org/sites/default/files/inline-files/CFA-Marion.OTL\\_Indicators\\_0.pdf](https://www.nciea.org/sites/default/files/inline-files/CFA-Marion.OTL_Indicators_0.pdf).
58. *State Education Agency Data Sharing and the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act*. NCEOSEA, June 2020, [https://nasbe.nyc3.digitaloceanspaces.com/2020/11/NCOSEA-FERPA\\_Final-Paper-2020.pdf](https://nasbe.nyc3.digitaloceanspaces.com/2020/11/NCOSEA-FERPA_Final-Paper-2020.pdf).
59. *Education Data 101: A Briefing Book for Policymakers*, Data Quality Campaign, March 31, 2021, [DQC-EducationData101-031821.pdf](https://www.dataqualitycampaign.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/03/DQC-EducationData101-031821.pdf).